

# EXPERIMENTAL EVOLUTION

*Concepts, Methods, and Applications  
of Selection Experiments*

EDITED BY

Theodore Garland Jr.

Michael R. Rose



UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA PRESS

*Berkeley Los Angeles London*

THIS BOOK WAS MADE POSSIBLE IN PART BY A GRANT FROM  
BJ DESIGN TRUST AND THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA.

TK

University of California Press, one of the most distinguished university presses in the United States, enriches lives around the world by advancing scholarship in the humanities, social sciences, and natural sciences. Its activities are supported by the UC Press Foundation and by philanthropic contributions from individuals and institutions. For more information, visit [www.ucpress.edu](http://www.ucpress.edu).

University of California Press  
Berkeley and Los Angeles, California

University of California Press, Ltd.  
London, England

© 2009 by the Regents of the University of California

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Surname, Firstname, birthdate--.

Title : subtitle / Author.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-520-number(alk. paper).—ISBN 0-520-number (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Subject—Subsubject. 2. Subject—Subsubject.  
3. Subject—Subsubject. 4. Subject—Subsubject. I. Title.

ClassifNumber PubDate

DeweyNumber—dc21

CatalogNumber

Manufactured in [country name]

16 15 14 13 12 11 10 09 08

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of  
ANSI/NISO Z39.48-1992 (R 1997) (*Permanence of Paper*). ∞

Cover illustration: [caption and credit].

*T.G. dedicates this to his family, including his grandparents (Mildred Snyder, Fred William Abildgaard Jr., and Mary M. Wrenn), parents (Coleen Abildgaard and Theodore Garland), wife (Wendy Saltzman, PhD), and children (Theodore Garland III and Jaden Lee Garland).*

*M.R.R. also dedicates this book to his family, near and far, Rose's and all.*

# CONTENTS

## PART I: INTRODUCTION TO EXPERIMENTAL EVOLUTION • 1

1. Darwin's Other Mistake · 3  
*Michael R. Rose and Theodore Garland Jr.* · 3
  - Correcting Darwin's Other Mistake · 4
  - Definitions and Concepts · 6
  - Macroevolution, Microevolution, and the Role of Selection Experiments · 8
  - Overview of This Volume: Exclusions and Inclusions · 9
  
2. The Importance of Experimental Studies in Evolutionary Biology · 15  
*Douglas J. Futuyma and Albert F. Bennett* · 15
  - Methods of Studying Evolution · 16
  - Two Examples of the Contribution of Experimental Studies to Understanding Evolution · 20
  - Conclusions · 26

3.	Modeling Experimental Evolution Using Individual-Based, Variance-Components Models	· 31
	<i>Derek A. Roff and Daphne J. Fairbairn</i>	· 31
	Modeling Approaches	· 33
	Single-Trait Models	· 36
	Multiple-Trait Models	· 43
	A Case Study: Predicting Laboratory Evolution in the Sand Cricket, <i>Gryllus firmus</i>	· 51
	Conclusion	· 58
	<b>PART II: TYPES OF EXPERIMENTAL EVOLUTION</b>	<b>• 65</b>
4.	Experimental Evolution from the Bottom Up	· 67
	<i>Daniel E. Dykhuizen and Anthony M. Dean</i>	· 67
	A Bottom-up Analysis of the Lactose System	· 69
	Other Approaches	· 82
	Discussion	· 83
5.	Experimental Evolutionary Domestication	· 89
	<i>Pedro Simões, Josiane Santos, and Margarida Matos</i>	· 89
	Evolutionary Domestication: Real-Time Studies in <i>Drosophila subobscura</i>	· 93
	Comparative Studies of Domestication	· 99
	General Issues	· 104
6.	Long-Term Experimental Evolution and Adaptive Radiation	· 111
	<i>Michael Travisano</i>	· 111
	What Is Long-Term Evolution?	· 112
	The Need for Long-Term Evolution Studies	· 112
	Successes and Challenges for Long-Term Evolution	· 114
	Diversification and Specialization	· 115
	Caution Is Required	· 126
	How Long Is Long Enough?	· 127
	Recommendations	· 128
7.	The Experimental Study of Reverse Evolution	· 135
	<i>Suzanne Estes and Henrique Teotônio</i>	· 135
	A Brief History of the Problem of Reversions	· 136
	Experimental Research on Reverse Evolution	· 139
	Reverse Evolution and the Inference of Evolutionary Relationships	· 141
	Contingency and Reverse Evolution	· 146

	The Population Genetics of Reverse Evolution	· 150
	Outlook	· 155
	Glossary	· 161
8.	Field Experiments, Introductions, and Experimental Evolution: A Review and Practical Guide	· 173
	<i>Duncan J. Irschick and David Reznick</i>	· 173
	Methods for Field Manipulations	· 175
	What Can We Learn from Field Experiments That We Cannot Learn from Laboratory Studies?	· 185
	Conclusion	· 189
	<b>PART III: LEVELS OF OBSERVATION IN EXPERIMENTAL EVOLUTION</b>	<b>• 195</b>
9.	Fitness, Demography, and Population Dynamics in Laboratory Experiments	· 197
	<i>Laurence D. Mueller</i>	· 197
	Early Foundations of Population Biology	· 198
	Empirical Measures of Fitness	· 200
	Ecological and Evolutionary Studies of Population Dynamics	· 204
	Discussion	· 211
10.	Laboratory Selection Studies of Life-History Physiology in Insects	· 217
	<i>Anthony J. Zera and Lawrence G. Harshman</i>	· 217
	Laboratory Selection: Strengths, Limitations, Caveats	· 219
	Model Species and Research Topics	· 221
	Conclusion	· 251
11.	Behavior and Neurobiology	· 263
	<i>Justin S. Rhodes and Tadeusz J. Kawecki</i>	· 263
	Behavior Evolves First	· 265
	The Evolution of Behavior	· 266
	Experimental Methods	· 268
	Examples of Correlated Responses to Selection on Behavior	· 284
	The Evolution of Mating Systems in Voles: From Genes to Behavior	· 287
	Testing Adaptive Hypotheses	· 290
	Relevance for Public Health	· 291
	Conclusions and Future Directions	· 291

12. Selection Experiments and Experimental Evolution of Performance and Physiology · 301

*John G. Swallow, Jack P. Hayes, Pawel Koteja, and Theodore Garland Jr.* · 301

- The Importance of Replication · 305
- Experimental Evolution of Mice in Different Thermal Environments · 306
- Wind Tunnel Flight in *Drosophila* · 307
- Endurance Running and Stress-Induced Analgesia in Mice · 308
- Endurance Running in Rats and Voluntary Wheel Running in Mice · 309
- Evolution of the Rate of Energy Metabolism in Rodents · 314
- Sexual Selection: Effects of Ornaments on Performance · 326
- “Experiments” without Precisely Defined Selection Criteria · 329
- Physiological Differences among Strains of Mice and Breeds of Dog · 331
- Conclusion · 333

13. Through a Glass, Clearly: *Experimental Evolution as a Window on Adaptive Genome Evolution* · 353

*Frank Rosenzweig and Gavin Sherlock* · 353

- Adaptive Evolution · 355
- Experimental Evolutionary Genomics of Bacteria · 355
- Experimental Evolutionary Genomics of Yeast · 376
- Opening Windows in Genome Evolution in Higher Eukaryotes · 379
- Future Prospects · 380

**PART IV: APPLICATIONS OF EXPERIMENTAL EVOLUTION • 389**

14. Understanding Evolution through the Phages · 391

*Samantha E. Forde and Christine M. Jessup* · 391

- The Biology of Phages · 394
- Quantitative Models of Phage-Host Systems · 395
- The Genetic Basis of Evolutionary Adaptation · 396
- Adaptation to Abiotic Conditions, Genotype-by-Environment Interactions · 403
- Adaptation to Biotic Conditions · 405

	Phylogenetics	·	411
	Implications of Phage Evolution Experiments	·	412
	Conclusion	·	414
15.	Experimental Approaches to Studying the Evolution of Animal Form: <i>The Shape of Things to Come</i>	·	419
	<i>W. Anthony Frankino, Douglas J. Emlen, and Alexander W. Shingleton</i>	·	419
	Mathematical Descriptions of Shape Variation	·	424
	Development, Selection, and the Evolution of Scaling Relationships	·	428
	Incorporating Development into Studies of Shape Evolution	·	435
	Experimental Evolution of Scaling Relationships	·	440
	Special Opportunities Provided by Polymorphic Species with Nonlinear Scaling Relationships	·	458
	Conclusions and Future Directions	·	460
16.	Sexual Exploits in Experimental Evolution	·	479
	<i>Paul E. Turner, Robert C. McBride, and Clifford W. Zeyl</i>	·	479
	Costs and Benefits of Sex	·	480
	Viral Sex	·	485
	Bacterial Sex	·	495
	Eukaryotic Sex	·	499
	What Have We Learned from Sexual Explorations Using Experimental Evolution?	·	514
17.	Physiological Adaptation in Laboratory Environments	·	523
	<i>Allen G. Gibbs and Eran Gefen</i>	·	523
	Environmental Stress in the Laboratory	·	524
	Temperature Stress in <i>Drosophila</i>	·	524
	Temperature Selection in Microbes	·	526
	Laboratory Evolution in Aquatic Environments:		
	Osmotic Stress	·	527
	Resource Limitation in Insects: Survival of the Fattest?	·	528
	Nutritional Selection in Microbial Populations	·	530
	<i>Drosophila</i> in Laboratory Deserts	·	532
	What's the Gene?	·	537
	Unintended Selection in Laboratory Environments	·	540
	Conclusion	·	542
18.	Evolution of Aging and Late Life	·	551
	<i>Cassandra L. Rauser, Laurence D. Mueller, Michael Travisano, and Michael R. Rose</i>	·	551



	Evolutionary Theories of Aging	·	552
	The Role of Experimental Evolution in Testing Hamiltonian Theories of Aging	·	559
	Evolutionary Biology of Late Life	·	566
	The Impact of Experimental Evolution on Aging Research	·	577
19.	Theoretical and Experimental Approaches to the Evolution of Altruism and the Levels of Selection	·	585
	<i>Benjamin Kerr</i>	·	585
	Theoretical Background	·	590
	Experimental Research	·	597
	Discussion	·	616
20.	Laboratory Experiments on Speciation	·	631
	<i>James D. Fry</i>	·	631
	Key Concepts	·	633
	What Past Experiments Have Taught Us	·	633
	Neglected Questions	·	638
	General Guidelines for Experiments on Speciation	·	649
	Conclusion	·	651
	<b>PART V: CONCLUSION</b>	·	<b>657</b>
21.	A Critique of Experimental Phylogenetics	·	659
	<i>Todd H. Oakley</i>	·	659
	The Perceived Inferiority of Historical Science	·	660
	Testing Phylogenetic Methods	·	662
	Increased Biological Realism	·	665
	Conclusion	·	666
22.	Laboratory Evolution Meets Catch-22: Balancing Simplicity and Realism	·	671
	<i>Raymond B. Huey and Frank Rosenzweig</i>	·	671
	Using LNS to Test Hypotheses Derived from Comparative Studies	·	675
	Problems Associated with Laboratory Adaptation	·	678
	A Case Study: A Selection Experiment at Odds with Field Studies	·	686
	On Modifying LNS Experiments	·	689
	Conclusion	·	691
	Index	·	703

# LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

**ALBERT F. BENNETT**

Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology  
University of California  
Irvine, California

**ANTHONY M. DEAN**

Department of Ecology, Evolution, & Behavior  
BioTechnology Institute  
University of Minnesota  
St. Paul, Minnesota

**DANIEL E. DYKHUIZEN**

Department of Ecology & Evolution  
Stony Brook University  
Stony Brook, New York

**DOUGLAS J. EMLEN**

Division of Biological Sciences  
University of Montana  
Missoula, Montana

**SUZANNE ESTES**

Department of Biology  
Portland State University  
Portland, Oregon

**DAPHNE J. FAIRBAIRN**

Department of Biology  
University of California  
Riverside, California

**SAMANTHA E. FORDE**

Ecology & Evolution Department  
University of California  
Santa Cruz, California

**W. ANTHONY FRANKINO**

Department of Biology & Biochemistry  
University of Houston  
Houston, Texas

**JAMES D. FRY**

Department of Biology  
University of Rochester  
Rochester, New York

**DOUGLAS J. FUTUYMA**

Department of Ecology & Evolution  
Stony Brook University  
Stony Brook, New York

**THEODORE GARLAND JR.**

Department of Biology  
University of California  
Riverside, California

**ERAN GEFEN**

Department of Biology  
Haifa University—Oranim  
Haifa, Israel

**ALLEN G. GIBBS**

School of Life Sciences  
University of Nevada  
Las Vegas, Nevada

**LAWRENCE G. HARSHMAN**

School of Biological Sciences  
University of Nebraska  
Lincoln, Nebraska

**JACK P. HAYES**

Department of Biology  
University of Nevada  
Reno, Nevada

**RAYMOND B. HUEY**

Department of Biology  
University of Washington  
Seattle, Washington

**DUNCAN J. IRSCHICK**

Department of Biology  
Organismic & Evolutionary Biology Program  
University of Massachusetts  
Amherst, Massachusetts

**CHRISTINE M. JESSUP**

Center for Ecology and Evolutionary  
University of Oregon  
Eugene, Oregon

**TADEUSZ J. KAWECKI**

Department of Ecology & Evolution  
University of Lausanne  
Lausanne, Switzerland

**BENJAMIN KERR**

Department of Biology  
University of Washington  
Seattle, Washington

**PAWEL KOTEJA**

Institute of Environmental Sciences  
Jagiellonian University, Gronostajowa  
Krakow, Poland

**MARGARIDA MATOS**

Centro de Biologia Ambiental  
Departamento de Biologia de Biologia Animal, Universidad de Lisboa  
Lisbon, Portugal

**ROBERT C. McBRIDE**

Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology  
Yale University  
New Haven, Connecticut

**LAURENCE D. MUELLER**

School of Biological Sciences  
University of California  
Irvine, California

**TODD H. OAKLEY**

Department of Ecology, Evolution & Marine Biology  
University of California Santa Barbara, California

**CASANDRA L. RAUSER**

Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology  
University of California  
Irvine, California

**DAVID REZNICK**

Department of Biology  
University of California  
Riverside, California

**JUSTIN S. RHODES**

Department of Psychology  
University of Illinois  
Beckman Institute  
Urbana, Illinois

**DEREK A. ROFF**

Department of Biology  
University of California  
Riverside, California

**MICHAEL R. ROSE**

Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology  
University of California  
Irvine, California

**FRANK ROSENZWEIG**

Division of Biological Sciences  
University of Montana  
Missoula, Montana

**JOSIANE SANTOS**

Centro de Biologia Ambiental  
Departamento de Biologia de Biologia Animal  
Universidade de Lisboa Lisbon, Portugal

**GAVIN SHERLOCK**

Department of Genetics  
Stanford University School of Medicine  
Stanford, California

**ALEXANDER SHINGLETON**

Department of Zoology  
Michigan State University  
East Lansing, Michigan

**PEDRO SIMÕES**

Centro de Biologia Ambiental  
Departamento de Biologia de Biologia Animal  
Universidade de Lisboa Lisbon, Portugal

**JOHN G. SWALLOW**

Department of Biology  
University of South Dakota  
Vermillion, South Dakota

**HENRIQUE TEOTÓNIO**

Instituto Gulbenkian de Ciencia  
Oeiras, Portugal

**MICHAEL TRAVISANO**

Department of Ecology, Evolution, & Behavior  
University of Minnesota  
St. Paul, Minnesota

**PAUL E. TURNER**

Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology  
Yale University  
New Haven, Connecticut

**ANTHONY J. ZERA**

School of Biological Sciences  
University of Nebraska  
Lincoln, Nebraska

**CLIFFORD W. ZEYL**

Department of Biology  
Wake Forest University  
Winston-Salem, North Carolina